

Of Ethnoscapes, Gazes and the Struggle of the Split Self: OFW Inter-cultural Encounters in the Middle East MARY JANNETTE L. PINZON

# Philippine Humanities Review

Volume 21, Issue 2, 2019, pp. 65-102 ISSN-0031-7802 © 2019 University of the Philippines

# Of Ethnoscapes, Gazes and the Struggle of the Split Self: OFW Inter-cultural Encounters in the Middle East

Mary Jannette L. Pinzon

This paper interrogates how the OFW phenomenon, as an ethnoscape, provides unique inter-cultural encounters to OFWs as they move from their local cultures to the cultures of their destination countries. The study describes the OFWs' various expressions of racial discrimination in three cultural milieus including Saudi Arabia, Qatar and United Arab Emirates The paper problematizes how the OFWs deal with realities in these socially constructed inter-cultural spaces using the lenses of Appadurai's concept of ethnoscape and Urry's issues of tourist gaze. The paper illustrates that using these frameworks, and connecting them to Jocano's framework of Filipino values, points to a new identity borne out of a holistic

67

sense of self where the OFW persona is empowered by their cultural energy, an interior dimension of harmony (*loob*) as a way of suturing the split self.

Key Words: OFW phenomenon, ethnoscape, racial discrimination, tourist gaze, Filipino values, cultural energy, inter- cultural spaces, split self

The Overseas Filipino Workers (OFW) phenomenon, representing an ethnoscape, a landscape of moving persons, provides unique inter-cultural encounters as people move from their local cultures to the cultures of their destination countries. One of the characteristics of this phenomenon is deterritorialization where cultural groups live apart from their territory, change the scapes to adapt themselves to the new situation, and in this process, create the tension between openness to global processes and the will to retain a cultural identity (Appadurai 37). As they inhabit in this ethnoscape reality, the OFW deterritorialised actors take on the tourist gaze that involves a binary division between the everyday/ordinary and the extraordinary (Mackie 1). Urry's concept of tourist gaze (14) relates to Appadurai's framework of ethnoscape where within it are imagined selves and imagined worlds (3). It leads to a perspective that every experience, every adventure in the ethnoscape represents an embodiment of difference (Urry and Rojek; cited in Mackie 1). The OFW deterritorialised actors "gaze upon or view a set of different scenes, of landscapes or townscapes that are out of the ordinary," and beyond one's locality. (Urry and Larsen 2). This experience exemplifies a notion of departure from those typically encountered in everyday life and consequently leads to a distinct ethnoscape reality.

This study looks into the experiences of the OFW deterritorialised actors through the lens of Appadurai's ethnoscapes and Urry's tourist gaze. It interrogates how the OFW phenomenon provides unique inter-cultural encounters to OFWs within the ethnoscape life orientation. The paper investigates the deterritorialised context where specifically OFWs experience various expressions of racial discrimination in the Middle East - Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (KSA), Qatar, and the United Arab Emirates UAE), the OFWs reactions to these acts of discrimination, their support systems and the adjustments they make to accommodate unfamiliar intercultural spaces. The study recognizes, however, that much of the immediate help comes from the OFWs' personal strength and efforts as they deal with the challenges they face. As the study investigates the conflicted ethnoscape that the OFW deterritorialised actors inhabit, it is inevitable that Jocano's framework of Filipino cultural values is taken into consideration. How do Filipino values embedded in the actors' personal and cultural identity mesh with and suture the OFW ethnoscape in their attempt to survive their challenging and unfamiliar work environment. In connection with this, the study relates to Alejo's concept of cultural energy as he explicates that it springs from the actors' own moral and cultural resources. Hence, this paper problematizes how the OFWs help their deterritorialised selves through the ethnoscape gaze, the Filipino values they hold and their cultural energy as strategies to suture the split self and achieve a holistic sense of self in the unfamiliar context.

Understanding the everyday realities of the OFWs in their destination countries is crucial in helping their families and their communities understand them, develop ways to assist and help them succeed. More importantly, the study hopes to contribute to studies on the lived experiences of OFWs in the

69

Middle East as a powerful tool and useful means to understand intercultural politics between the government of labor-sending countries and the government of labor-receiving-countries to enact laws not just to define the rights and protection of foreign domestic workers but impose strict implementation as well. In addition, this paper hopes to be a part of the continuing effort to awaken the Government of labor-sending countries to provide needed support and extensive services to domestic workers in a foreign land.

Ethnoscape is a term coined by Arjun Appadurai in his essay "Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy" (33). It is defined as the flow of people across boundaries. It is a landscape of persons who constitute the shifting world in which we live. These refer to the tourists, immigrants, refugees, exiles, and guest workers such as the OFWs. The use of the suffix "scape" is meant to illustrate that these are cultural vistas which depend on the position of a given spectator, and that they are constantly changing. Based on Appadurai's description of ethnoscapes, it can be said that mobile groups and populations are now essential features of societies everywhere. More people and groups increasingly deal with realities of having to move or the fantasies of wanting to move (Appadurai 34).

The concept of ethnoscapes provides a productive framework in understanding the shifting cultural and social landscapes in which contemporary people such as the OFWs are often embedded in their daily lives. The OFW phenomenon, instantiates what Appadurai calls "an idea of situated difference" (12) in relation to something local, embodied and significant. OFWs situate themselves in the growing presence of social norms of contact and involvement that go beyond the limits of their local territories and become deterritorialised actors. In a deterritorialised context, the globalization of everyday

experiences makes it more difficult to maintain a stable sense of cultural identity as OFW life entwines itself more and more with influences and experiences of remote origin. Giddens pointed out that deterritorialization, considered as a central feature of globalization, speaks of a kind of weighing of anchors of social relations (qtd. in Hernandez 92) that brings OFW deterritorialised actors to a "closer involvement with the external, generates closeness in distance, and to a relative distancing from what is close." (Hernandez 93). OFWs re-invent themselves from their own local situation, they become familiar with landscapes and cultural products foreign to their locality.

OFWs are reported to being abused and maltreated by their employers abroad. Senator Sonny Angara, one of the authors of the Magna Carta of Women of 2009 or Republic Act 9710 noted that eighty percent of migrant domestic workers, mostly women, in different parts of the world suffer abuse. OFWs risk maltreatment, physical and sexual abuse, even death in their quest for jobs, a better future for their children and their families back home. Several studies reveal an alarming prevalence of abuses against domestic workers in the Arab region (Acosta and Acosta 2; Hosoda 1). The tragic cases of Joanna Demafelis in 2018 and Jeanelyn Villavende in 2019, both domestic workers in Kuwait, are among countless others of abuse, mistreatment and tragedy involving migrant domestic workers in the Gulf region.

Racial and Ethnic discrimination are some of the most serious problems faced by Overseas Filipino workers all over the world. Racial discrimination occurs when an individual is subject to unequal treatment because of their actual or perceived race. An example of racial discrimination is when someone from a different racial group who, in similar circumstances, has been or would have been, treated more favorably than you. Discrimination

may have many effects including trauma and stress. It may reflect an othering process whereby perpetrators reinforce the social exclusion of recipients. De Guzman's (1993) study inquired into the living and working conditions of the OFWs in Saudi Arabia. The study reports that OFWs who work in construction companies complain of human relations or the way they are treated by their Arab supervisors. "Mabagsik ang amo ko" (My employer is cruel). They also complain about the 'harsh, if not inhuman,' provisions in the Saudi Labor Code where protest actions have stiff penalties of imprisonment and fines (29). The law reinforces the OFWs sense of helplessness. "Wala ring mangyayari kung aangal" (Even if we complain, nothing happens) (30). The study of Ragma and Molina reveal similar results to Pillay's earlier study that discrimination and rights violations contribute to the growing fears of OFWs in their workplace and feed mistrust and abuse (Ragma and Molina 8).

## The Setting of Labor Migration of Filipinos

In the 1970s, the Philippine government initiated an overseas employment program to address rising unemployment, serious foreign-debt problems and the need to bring in scarce foreign exchange. At the same time, the oil-rich Gulf countries needed workers to realize their ambitious infrastructure projects. With supply and demand factors converging, the Philippines was ripe for large-scale labor migration. Marcos passed the Labor Code of 1974 and institutionalized its labor export policy (Pernia 4). It was a temporary stop-gap measure for the rapidly escalating unemployment and a strategic response to the employment opportunities brought forth by the Middle East oil boom in the 1970s. What was intended to be temporary became a permanent one as administrations following Marcos pursued the same labor export policy. The continuing demand for workers

in the Gulf countries and the opening of labor markets in other regions fueled further migration. This movement reflects the deterritorialised selves created as labor populations are brought into the lower economic class sectors and spaces of wealthier societies (Appadurai 37). On the supply side, the absence of sustained economic development, political instability, a growing population, double-digit unemployment levels, and low wages continue to compel people to work abroad. Since the 1970's, the Philippines had supplied all kinds of skilled and low-skilled workers to the world's more developed regions. In the last 30 years, a "culture of migration" has emerged (Lane 27; De Guzman 19; Asis 1; Pernia 14).

Millions of Filipinos are eager to work abroad despite the risks and vulnerabilities they are likely to face. Asis reports that in a nationwide survey of 1,200 adult respondents in 2002, one in five Filipinos express a desire to migrate (1). Latest statistics from POEA show that in 2013, nearly 2.2 million OFWs were deployed abroad, higher compared to 2 million in 2012 and 1.8 million in 2011. Of the total, almost 1.7 million were land-based workers including over 562,000 new hires and more than 1.2 million rehires. Meanwhile sea-based workers numbered over 467,915. POEA latest reports show steadily increasing numbers of OFWs leaving the country.

This study focuses on the following research questions:

- 1. What are the various expressions of discrimination experienced by OFWs in the Middle East?
- 2. How do OFWs respond to these acts of discrimination?
- 3. What support systems do they have that help them in their stay in the receiving country?
- 4. How do they adjust to their new environment?

## Methodology

This is a descriptive qualitative study focusing on forms of racial discrimination experienced by OFWs in KSA, UAE and Qatar. Online survey questionnaire was conducted through Facebook friends who are OFWs in the countries covered in this study.My Facebook friends assisted in finding other respondents. Fourteen respondents (14) from Doha, Qatar, twenty-six respondents from UAE and fifteen from KSA participated in this study. Questionnaires were returned either via email or Messenger. Data in this study is supplemented by an earlier online survey among OFWs in KSA. The data of the study could have been supplemented by interviews or focus group discussions. More information could have been collected if deeper interactions could be made with the respondents. As such, the study is limited with the very nature of the method used to gather data, but as for the time allowed for the duration of the study, the survey-questionnaire method is deemed most feasible and pragmatic to be able to reach as many respondents as possible. In the course of the study, I realized that the questionnaire can be further revised for clearer or more concrete responses from the respondents. For example, in the item the country or state where the respondent resides, the city should have been included. The item, "support systems" was misunderstood by one respondent. The answer provided was "dependent, work, visa". However negligible this might be, I feel I might still need to think of a better term. I also did not include sex of the respondents among the demographic data I requested. Although this is not a variable in the study, this information could help in the interpretation and discussion of data, that is, sex in relation to racial discrimination. Nevertheless, the data yielded some information related to this concern.

#### **Results and Discussion**

This study included OFWs who are working at present in three countries in the Middle East, namely, Qatar, United Arab Emirates and Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. I will discuss the results of the study by country.

## **Profile of Respondents**

### DOHA, QATAR

A total of 14 respondents participated in the survey questionnaire. Among the respondents, six said they did not experience any discrimination. Two did not provide answers for some questions. Six respondents indicated that they have experienced racial discrimination. For the purposes of the study, only the last 6 were considered. The respondents were between the ages of 26-40 years old. They have stayed in Doha between 1 year to 13 years and with varied occupations. (see Table 1)

 Table 1

 Summary of Respondents' Profile from Qatar

| Respondents | Age      | Occupation   | Place of | Length of     |
|-------------|----------|--------------|----------|---------------|
|             |          |              | work     | Stay in years |
| 1           | 26       | Waitress     | Doha     | 1             |
| 2           | 40       | Nurse        | Doha     | 10            |
| 3           | Did not  | Head nurse   | Doha     | 13            |
|             | indicate |              |          |               |
| 4           | 34       | Housekeeping | Doha     | 7             |
| 5           | 37       | Radiology    | Doha     | 10            |
|             |          | technician   |          |               |
| 6           | 34       | Housekeeping | Doha     | 4             |

### UNITED ARAB EMIRATES

A total of 26 respondents participated in the survey questionnaire. Among the respondents, six said they did not experience any discrimination. Five did not provide answers for some questions and were set aside. Sixteen indicated racial discrimination. For the purposes of the study, only the last 16 were considered. The respondents from the UAE have ages between 27-55 years old. Their places of work are in Sharjah, Dubai and Abu Dhabi. Five did not indicate the specific state they are in. Their stay in the UAE ranges from 2 years to 18 years and with varied occupations. (see Table 2)

**Table 2**Summary of Respondents' Profile from the UAE

| Respondents | Age | Occupation       | Place of | Length of     |
|-------------|-----|------------------|----------|---------------|
|             |     |                  | work     | Stay in years |
| 1           | 37  | Admin Manager    | Sharjah  | 7             |
|             |     | Estimation Engr/ |          |               |
| 2           | 32  | Procurement      | UAE      | 9             |
|             |     | Officer          |          |               |
| 3           | 41  | Administration   | Dubai    | 10            |
| 4           | 34  | Architectural    | UAE      | 7             |
|             |     | Draftsman        |          |               |
| 5           | 36  | Office manager   | Dubai    | 5             |
|             |     | Legal Consultant |          |               |
| 6           | 40  | (Citizen by      | Sharjah  | 6             |
|             |     | Investment)      |          |               |
| 7           | 30  | Engineer         | Dubai    | 4             |
| 8           | 33  | Engineer         | UAE      | 9             |
| 9           | 29  | Senior Piping    | KSA/     | 2             |
|             |     | Designer         | UAE      |               |

|    |    | Estimator       | Abu     | KSA=11/ |  |
|----|----|-----------------|---------|---------|--|
| 10 | 40 | (Electrical     |         |         |  |
|    |    | Engineer)       | Dhabi   | UAE=6   |  |
| 11 | 34 | Graphic         | Abu     | 7       |  |
| 11 | 34 | Speacialist     | Dhabi   | /       |  |
| 12 | 30 | Electrical      | Chariah | 6       |  |
| 12 | 30 | Engineer        | Sharjah | 6       |  |
| 13 | 41 | Teacher         | Sharjah | 10      |  |
| 14 | 29 | Hairstylist     |         | 7       |  |
| 15 | 27 | Sales Assistant | UAE     | 4       |  |
| 16 | 55 | Office          |         | 18      |  |
| 10 | 33 | Coordinator     |         | 10      |  |

#### KINGDOM OF SAUDI ARABIA

A total of 15 respondents participated in the survey questionnaire. Among the respondents, one said he did not experience any discrimination. Two mentioned religious discrimination. Eleven indicated racial discrimination. For the purposes of the study, only the last 11 were considered. Respondents in Saudi Arabia are with ages from 28–51 years old. Their places of work are at Jeddah and Makkah. Four respondents did not indicate their specific state. They have varied occupations. Their length of stay ranges from 1 year to 14 years. (see Table 3)

**Table 3**Summary of Respondents' Profile from KSA

| Respondents | Age | Occupation       | Place of | Length of |
|-------------|-----|------------------|----------|-----------|
|             |     |                  | work     | Stay      |
| 1           | 21  | Eliabe Assardans | Jeddah,  | 10        |
| 1           | 31  | Flight Attendant | KSA      | 10 years  |
| 2           | 21  | Diale Assertant  | Jeddah,  | 0         |
| 2           | 31  | Flight Attendant | KSA      | 9 years   |

| 3  | 33 | None              | KSA     | 10 years&  |
|----|----|-------------------|---------|------------|
|    |    |                   |         | 2mos       |
| 4  | 28 | Flight Attendant  | KSA     | 1 year & 6 |
| 4  |    |                   |         | mos        |
| 5  | 30 | Staff Nurse       | Makkah, | 7 years    |
|    |    |                   | KSA     |            |
| 6  | 37 | Flight Attendant  | KSA     | 9 years    |
| 7  | 29 | Nurse             | Makkah, | 7 years    |
|    |    |                   | KSA     |            |
| 8  | 33 | Respiratory       | Jeddah, | 13 years   |
|    |    | Therapist         | KSA     |            |
| 9  | 29 | Registered Nurse  | Jeddah  | 14 years   |
| 10 | 40 | Housemaid         | Jeddahi | 11 years   |
| 11 | 34 | Karate instructor | KSA     | 9 years    |

The profile of the respondents shows us that they have stayed long enough in their countries of destination to provide sufficient data for the study. The differences in line of work also show that discrimination is not limited to, rather encompasses all types of employment in these Middle Eastern countries. The study results are consistent with the Bello Report (9), however, that domestic workers suffer the most maltreatment, abuse and discrimination. This respondent profile gives us a picture of the OFW deterritorialised actors present in the OFW ethnoscape.

### Forms of Racial Discrimination

## DOHA, QATAR

Respondents reported racial discrimination expressed in the "pilahan" process in Doha. Three out of six indicated this particular experience. Respondent 1 - "Sa pilahan palaging nahuhuli inuuna ang katutubo."

([We are] always less prioritized in queues, natives are prioritized.)

Respondent 2 & 5 - "Diskriminasyon sa pila, nauuna ang mga tagarito."

([There is] discrimination in queues, locals are prioritized.)

There is also discrimination in giving out prescriptive medicines. Respondent 3 related this personal experience:

"Here in Qatar, Qatari people are the first priority. Example: I was having indigestion and the doctor prescribed me a medication that I need to take twice a day and I suggested to order for me a medication that I know, and this medication I need to take it only once a day. The doctor told me that the medication is only for Qataris, he prescribed another medication and wrote the medication that I have recommended and advised me to try if I can get it in the Pharmacy. In the Pharmacy, I presented the once a day medication prescription and the same response I have received from the Pharmacist."

Respondents 4 and 6 mentioned that race, or their being Filipino, made them experience wage discrimination.

"Mababaang pasahod kompara sa ibang lahi."

(The salary is low compared to other nationalities.)

"Sa kumpanya ko po masyado mababa ang pasahod sa mga Asian."

(In my company, the wage of Asians is too low.)

#### 79

#### UNITED ARAB EMIRATES

In the UAE, respondent 13 reported a similar "pilahan" experience:

Expats fall in line but locals don't.

Out of 16 respondents, eight mentioned wage and promotion discrimination because of their being Filipinos. Respondents 2, 6, 11 and 12 said:

"Kadalasan tungkol sa salary package. Kahit madami na ang karanasan o kaalaman kaysa sa kasabayan mong ibang lahi lalo na pag Aarabo, mas malaki ang ibinibigay na salary package sa kanila."

(Most often it concerns the salary package. Even if you have more work experience or working knowledge than your foreign co-workers they are given a bigger salary package, more so if they are Arabs.)

"In terms of salaries, Arabs get more salary but work less."

"Malinaw na malaki ang agwat ng pagkakaiba ng pagtrato ng Filipino na manggagawa at sa expat na galing Europa, Estados Unidos, at iba pang bansa. Agwat sa suweldo at pagkakaroon ng pagkakataon na umangat sa posisyon. Parehong trabaho ngunit magkaiba ang suweldo dahil nakabatay sa bansang pinanggalingan."

(It is clear there is a large gap between the treatment of Filipino workers and expats from Europe, the United States and other countries. A gap in wage and the opportunity to be promoted. The work maybe the same but the wage will vary depending on the country of origin.)

"Ang pagturing ng mga ibang lahi sa mga Pilipino, mapa babae man o mapa lalake. Sa pampubliko o pribadong lugar, sa sahod ng mga expat sa Pilipino na kahit pareho lamang sila ng taon ng eksperyensa at posisyon."

(The way Filipinos are treated by other nationalities, whether they are male or female. Whether in public or private places. In the salaries of expats and Filipinos even though they have the same years of experience and job position.)

It is reported that Saudi-based employers prefer Filipinos to other migrant nationalities and yet, OFWs are discriminated in wages and benefits. Some respondents indicated that other nationalities are preferred over Filipinos. This is seen in how Filipinos are treated in different situations:

## Respondent 3:

"Sa isang exhibition, isang British lady na nagpo-promote ng product nila but if they saw that it's Filipino ang gustong mag-usyoso or makinig, they will not entertain it. Instead they pretend they don't see them."

(In an exhibition, a British lady was promoting a product. But when she saw that Filipinos were interested and listening, she did not entertain them. Instead, [she pretended not to] see them.)

## Respondent 8:

"I would not consider my experience as a big deal, but I would say that it was a discrimination. It happened to me a number of times. I'll just share one experience. I remember walking in a government office here in UAE, to complete some documents. When one of the staff told

me to go to another office for they cannot help me there (probably they just don't want me taking some of their time, for he is busy chatting with the person seated beside him). As I want to finish everything quickly, I went to the office he told me. After arriving, I was told to go back to the first office because they cannot be of help also. The following day, we ask the help of one friend who speaks Arabic, and to our surprise we accomplished what we came for that same day."

### Respondent 9:

"One time in getting a taxi, my wife and I were supposed to ride on it. And when we were inside I told to the driver that we are going to St. Michael church. After hearing this, he told us that he forgot that he has already a customer waiting for him. So we went out. And then afterwards we just see him getting another passenger (Indian) who is standing not far from us. Then he drove away."

At work, Respondent 7 and Respondent 15 experienced maltreatment and discrimination from their coworkers.

## Respondent 7:

"Yes, sa simula ng stay ko sa UAE mararamdaman yung discrimination. Merong paninigaw, pananakit, at meron din na pambabastos o pagpapatrabaho ng walang tigil at walang day-off. Ang una kong company ay Koreans, nasa kultura nila yung pagsigaw at pananakit kahit na sa kanila ay wala lang iyon. Pero nasa sa iyo din iyon kung hahayaan mo na saktan o sigawan ka nila. Pagdating naman sa pagta-trabaho, sobrang workaholic ng mga Koreans na nagsisimula ang araw naming ng 3:30

ng madaling araw hanggang 9-12 ng gabi. 2 beses lang ang off sa isang buwan, bayad naman ang overtime, pero minsan binabawasan nila iyon."

(Yes, since I came to UAE I could feel discrimination. There's shouting, battery, and also disrespect, overwork, and no days-off. My first company was with Koreans. It is in their culture to shout and hit so they think nothing of it. It is really up to you whether you allow them to shout at you or hurt you physically. When it comes to work, Koreans are very workaholic. So much so that work starts 3.30 at dawn and lasts until 9-12 in the evening. We only have two days off a month. Overtime is paid but sometimes, they have deductions.)

### Respondent 15:

"You cannot express your opinion."

Respondent 1 works in Sharjah, the UAE state that is the most conservative among the three states covered in this study. She reports experiencing sex discrimination because she is a Filipina:

"It's usual scenario here in Middle East if you are Filipina walking alone or doing shopping guys here think that you are an easy girl or sometimes a prostitute."

### KINGDOM OF SAUDI ARABIA

In KSA, the female respondents also report sex discrimination. Respondents 1 and 6 said that

"They think of 'Filipinos' as maids/servants. They consider as weak regardless of occupation or educational attainment."

"Ang tingin nila sa mga Pilipina pang bahay lang, kasambahay."

(They think that Filipinas are only for domestic work--domestic helpers.)

Respondent 7 who works as a flight attendant complained that

"Sometimes, Saudis don't respect us, and could treat us like slaves and not humans."

A domestic worker, Respondent 10 experienced maltreatment from her employers

"Maltreatment like nothing to eat only left over food, no food provided actually, long working hours, no rest days and no day off, unkind and inhuman like few hours of sleep only. Also they wake me up in the middle of my sleep to serve them Tea. Beating me if they don't get their demands quickly. They curse and say bad words to me."

Other respondents mentioned discrimination in treatment, sometimes being singled out because they are Filipinos.

## Respondent 11:

"Sa mga batian malimit yan laging una ang mga kalahi nila bago ako."

(In greeting, they usually address those of their own nationality before [Filipinos like] myself.)

#### Respondent 5:

"In my place of work, they give more favors to the Arabs than us Asians even we have the same positions. And some Saudis could treat us like we are less than them because we come to their country to work."

#### Respondent 4:

"I recall having to go through immigration. I needed to go ahead so when I noticed there was a new line and the officer was moving people from behind, I tried to change my line as well. I think he shouted, 'hey you Filipino? Go back to your line.' I just wanted to explain that my flight was departing soon so I need to go soon."

The following respondents reported that they experienced discrimination in wages and promotion at work.

## Respondent 8:

"In terms of sahod (pay), according to passport (Western and Middle Eastern) even if we know we deserve more than them."

## Respondent 9:

"Salary and position in the work including benefits."

## Respondent 3:

"You can never have higher positions than their nationals."

## Respondent 2:

"We don't get promotions in our job and bonuses like Ramadan bonus every year."

85

In an earlier online survey I conducted among OFWs in KSA the following narratives of some of the respondents' show consistent results.

#### A nurse in Al-Baha:

"Most Saudis think of themselves as (highly) superior than us, especially Asians. For example, somewhere in the city and there was a queue, the security guards were shouting on us Filipinos, and they were polite to those Arab people."

Another nurse complains that some patients treat us as maids, as if they own us.

### A flight attendant:

"Most of my coworkers are Arabs from Syria, Egypt, Morocco. Since they all look like Arabs and speak the same language, sometimes favors are given to them first like who gets to sit first in the restaurant or in the line in the bank."

In summary, the discrimination OFWs experienced in these 3 Middle Eastern countries are similar and related. These are 1) how they are treated as the "other" in the *pilahan*, 2) in giving out medicine, 3) in the giving of wages and promotion at work and 4) the female OFWs reported sex discrimination and maltreatment.

### How OFWs React to Discrimination

### DOHA, QATAR

The respondents in Doha had mixed reactions to the discrimination they experienced. In the *pilahan*, Respondent 1 said, "Wala lang maghintay lang" but Respondent 5 tried to complain to the supervisor but nothing happened "Sinubukan

kong magreklamo ngunit mismo supervisor wala rin nagawa." (I tried to complain but even the Supervisor himself couldn't do anything).

Respondent 4 was disappointed about the low wage as compared to other nationalities but the response of Respondent 6 pointed to a sense of learned helplessness, "wala naman pong trabaho sa Pilipinas" (there are no job opportunities in the Philippines)

Respondent 3 maintained the response of the other Qatar respondents, "You need to learn how to accept it."

#### UNITED ARAB EMIRATES

The respondents in UAE reacted in different ways to the discrimination they experienced. To the *pilahan* issue, Respondent 13 simply accepted reality. Respondents 2 and 6 did not like to receive lower wage so they either did not accept the job or left the company where they worked. The other respondents simply accepted the situation as there was no other way according to Respondent 10 unless the laws were changed while Respondent 16 said

"...just keep silent because it has been there as a normal way of life in the middle east-and that to protect my own job. Raising grievances especially on discrimination is not heard."

Although there is a level of acceptance, Respondent 12 takes this stance, "Hindi nagpapa intimidate sa ibang lahi pag dating sa trabaho."

Being discriminated against and treated as the other in certain situations, Respondents 3,8 and 9 just accepted the situation. "I just let it pass because I know that it is the culture in this country," Respondent 8 said.

As for the maltreatment and discrimination Respondents 7 and 15 reported, the latter kept silent about not being able to express his opinion, especially when talking with the police but former fought for his right. Respondent 7 said:

Ang naging reaksyon ko siyempre ay lumaban. Kahit na nasa banyagang teritoryo ako hindi ko hahayaan na gawin sa akin iyon ninuman. Lumalaban ako, pag sumigaw sila sisigaw din ako at kung nananakit sila binabantaan ko din sila na once na dumapo ang kamao o paa nila sa akin, babalik iyon sa kanila. Pagkatapos ng mga insidente na iyon, hindi naman na naulit at nangingilala na sila ng sisigawan at pagbubuhatan ng kamay.

(Of course, my reaction was to fight back. Even in a foreign territory, I will not allow myself to be maltreated by anyone. I fight back. When they shout at me, I shout back. When they try to hurt me, I warn them that I'll hurt them back the moment that they lay hands on me. After those incidents, it did not happen again. They became wary of who they shouted at or hurt.)

Having experienced sex discrimination and harassment, Respondent 1 also reacted bravely, "I usually slap them."

#### KINGDOM OF SAUDI ARABIA

The female respondents based in KSA who reported sex discrimination had the following courageous reactions:

## Respondent 1:

"I try to defend my countrymen and prove to them that Filipinos are strong, resilient, and hardworking people."

## Respondent 6:

"Pinrove ko sa kanila na magaling ang mga Pilipino, at mag-excel sila kahit saang field."

While Respondent 10 said: "I run away and left my job as housemaid. I ask help from my relative here in Jeddah." While Respondent 7 was more tolerant, "If it is not too major, I just ignore it. I've learned to cope."

Respondents 11, 5 and 4 who reported being embarrassed and maltreated accepted the situation. Respondent 11 said, "Wala naman hindi ko lang pinapansin kung malala naman pasensya na lang."(I don't mind. When it's really bad, I just try to be patient.)

Respondent 5 and 4 recognized being offended but looked at the situation squarely:

"At first, I really felt bad being discriminated. However, as years passed by, I get used it. I also learn their language. When you step into the country, it is good that you learn the language so you can properly communicate with them and can defend yourself and choose not to be discriminated."

"I kept quiet but, somehow, I felt a bit embarrassed to be called out like that. He can always say these things in a nice way."

The issues on wage discrimination and promotion at work were accepted by Respondents 2, 3, 8 and 9 as part of the intercultural encounter and experience. Respondent 3 summarized their reaction, "acceptance and understanding their culture."

The respondents had varied reactions to their intercultural encounters in the Middle East. Their reactions however can be summarized as having accommodated the "other"

culture, taking nonchalant perspectives, and yet, where their being Filipino is challenged, the respondents have displayed strength of character and mind.

## The Support Systems the help OFWs in their stay in the Middle East

### DOHA, QATAR

Respondents in Doha mention family and faith in God. This is summarized in what Respondent 4 stated: 'Pamilya at panalangin lang po sa Diyos.' Two respondents (1 and 6) mentioned no support system. They are very much on their own.

#### UNITED ARAB EMIRATES

Respondents in UAE revealed that family, friends, Filipino organizations, professional groups, faith in God, and personal goals keep them focused.

## Respondent 1 shared,

I have circle of friends whom I meet during my free time to share my thoughts etc. and sometimes I do volunteer works.

## While Respondent 7 expressed that

"Malaking tulong ang pagkakaruon ng kapwa Pinoy o kabayan sa lugar na pinagta-trabahuhan. Sa kaso ko, masuwerte ako kasi pagdating ko madaming kabayan na nagbibigay ng advice kung paano magre-react sa iba't ibang sitwasyon sa site. Pag ako ay bumababa ng Dubai, masuwerte ako at anduon din ang asawa ko na nakakausap ko at kasama ko din magsimba tuwing biyernes."

(Having other Pinoys or kabayan in the workplace is a great help. In my case, I was fortunate because upon my arrival many kabayan gave me advice on how to react to different situations in the site. When I take off days in Dubai, I am lucky to have my wife there who I could talk to and go to church with every Friday.)

Among the 16 respondents, only Respondent 15 said nothing meaning he was on his own while Respondent 3 did not give any answer.

### KINGDOM OF SAUDI ARABIA

Respondents in KSA expressed that their family back in the Philippines, Filipino friends in Saudi, faith in God and religion have been their sources of support. Respondent 2, 3 and 7 mentioned that online communication that new technology provides (skype, facetime, whatsapp) has helped keep in touch with family at home. Respondent 4 mentioned comparing notes with other OFWs in trying to understand the other culture:

"I talk with my friends about similar experiences and we just try to understand that they have a different mentality. They think they are superior than everyone else. Though sometimes they act rude and inappropriate. But I'm not saying everyone are like that."

In summary, buttresses for the OFWs were their family and friends. They also found support through their involvement in Filipino and professional groups. Lastly, faith in God, prayers and religion kept them focused.

## How OFWs Adjusted to their Environment

#### DOHA, QATAR

The respondents in Doha revealed different strategies that help them in the various spaces of inter-cultural encounters. Two respondents (1 and 5) expressed "lakas ng loob at pasensya." Respondent 6 mentioned "pakikisama sa kapwa" while Respondent 4 cited family "Iniisip ko lagi para sa pamilya ko ito kahit mahirap ini-enjoy ko na lang po." These perspectives illustrate Filipino culture where family and good relationships are priority.

Respondent 1 keeps busy at work while Respondent 3 issues accommodation strategies, "You need to learn their culture, behavior, language and the way of living."

### UNITED ARAB EMIRATES

In the UAE, respondents found it easier to adjust because of their association with other OFWs. Respondents 11 and 12 mentioned joining activities and events:

"Sa pagsali sa mga aktibidad, paglilibang at pagtulong sa kapwa at pakikisalamuha sa lahat ng makadaupang palad."

(Joining activities, having recreation, and helping others and mingling with people we come across with.)

"Pakikisalamuha sa mga kaibigang Pilipino, pag Sali sa mga event dito sa UAE."

(Mingling with Filipino friends, joining events here at UAE.)

Other respondents expressed how their families have helped them adjust with the challenging cultural spaces before them. Respondent 2 said:

"Lagi ko na lang na iniisip na para sa pamilya ko ang ginagawa ko at mapalad ako kasi nakarating ako dito samantalang maraming iba na hirap na hirap na makapasok sa bansa kung nasan man ako."

(I always think that what I do here is for my family and that I am fortunate that I was able to come here while others find it really hard to be able to enter this country.)

"It is quite easy because my sister's family is already here. And there are lot of Filipinos everywhere here in UAE so it is not that hard to adapt in the new environment."

Between family and friends, Respondent 7 seems to have summarized how they are an effective booster for the OFWs:

Malaking sakripisyo ang kinailangan para makapag-adjust sa bagong work environment. Iyon ay dahil sa disyerto ang lugar na aking pinagtrabahuhan. Mahirap maglakad sa buhanginan, kilometro ang kailangan on a lakarin para makarating sa pinakamalapit na pamilihan, paulit ulit ang pagkain. Sanayan na lang din sa sitwasyon kasi walang choice. O di kaya pag restday duon or half day ang trabaho, nagtitipon tipon kaming mga pinoy para magluto at magsalo salo. Siyempre andiyan pa din ang internet para makipag communicate sa Pinas at mga mahal sa buhay.

(Great sacrifice is needed to be able to adjust to a new work environment. That's because I work in the desert. It's difficult to walk on the sand, the nearest market is kilometers away, we eat the same food over and over again. It's a matter of getting used to the situation because there is no other choice. During our rest day or when we take a half-day off, we come together to cook and eat. Of course, we have the internet to communicate with our loved ones in the Philippines.)

In summary, respondents cited courage, acceptance, adaptability skills, respecting the rules, and this is what Respondent 15 was essentially saying, "You have to accept that the country has a totally different culture, rules and regulation."

### KINGDOM OF SAUDI ARABIA

Just as they are buttresses in the OFW life, family and friends also help in adjustment in their stay in KSA according to Respondents 2 and 4:

"With the help of my newly found friends that became like a family to me."

"Good friends and good company and after a while you'll get used to their culture."

Flexibility and resiliency are seen in the responses of Respondents 1, 5, and 11:

"It took a while for me to adjust to this environment, the constraints of the job, culture shock and being away from my family was hard enough but eventually being flexible helped me adjust."

"It is hard because I am far from my family but I just think that life became easier when I started to work here. This is where I get my salary for living."

"Madali akong naka adjust – parehas lang ng klema sa atin hindi lang maulan dito."

To respondents 3 and 6, adjustments to the new environment meant respecting the culture and following rules and regulations:

"It took me time. And I followed the rules and regulation of the kingdom"

"Tinry kong irespect ang culture nila and follow yung rules and regulations."

( I tried to respect their culture and follow their rules and regulations.)

To Respondent 9 it was "coping up with a different culture in everyday basis." Respondent 8 expressed what seemed to be the key, 'we need to adapt to their culture and tradition,' a skill that most Filipinos have proven to possess.

After escaping from her previous employer, Respondent 10 has started a new life with a new employer

"I am now working as housemaid with another employer still in Jeddah. I am grateful that my present employer help me fix my papers. I have now legal papers when the Saudi government grant amnesty last year to illegal workers in the kingdom."

The OFW ethnoscape, where the deterritorialised actors inhabit, opens various avenues or spaces for inter-cultural encounters between overseas Filipino workers and their Middle-Eastern counterparts. These encounters have challenged their

personal and cultural identity as Filipinos. The OFW actors' local identity can be described within the framework of Filipino cultural values. These values shape their behavior, their responses and provide the reasons why they see and do the things the way they do. Middle Eastern culture, therefore, is strange and unfamiliar, because it is different from our cultural values of pakikisama, pakikisalamamuha, and pakikipagkapwatao. The framework of cultural values appropriates shared meanings that underlie the acceptable ways of thinking, believing, and doing things. The responses of the OFWs to the discrimination and other forms of social and emotional violence inflicted by the dominant culture seem to be the articulation and activation of the Filipino value system embodied in pakikisama, pakikisalamamuha and pakikipagkapwa-tao. These cultural values serve as the pamantayan, the generic concept of the value system which is the basis to recognize, express and evaluate social behavior (Jocano 3).

Kung ano ang tanaw ay siyang nakikita; Kung ano ang nakikita ay siyang nararamdaman Kung ano ang nararamdaman ay siyang ginagawa. How you look is what you see What you see is how you feel How you feel is what you do

The focus of Filipino traditional value of *halaga* is personto-person and person-to-society relations. In person-to-person relations, the level of intimacy or degree of social distance between two individuals is given importance. For example, kinship relations are given more value than non-kin relations. Jocano writes about the Filipino family as the center of the universe of every Filipino. Blood ties are emphasized even as kinship is seen deep in the heart of relationships (13). The family is the source of everything in life — economic resources, social, and religious guidance, psychological assistance, care for the elderly, and help in times of crisis. In the Filipino languages we find linguistic

expressions that show the rich concept of magkakamag-anak (Tagalog) or kaparientihan (Ilonggo) or kabagian (Ilocano) as buttresses of family solidarity (49-50). The Filipino family is a source of stable reservoir of emotional support and security. Thus, when the OFW states "para sa pamilya ko ito," it clearly highlights the cultural value of family solidarity. On the other hand, in person-to society relations, more attention is given to duties and obligations we share as members of society. Value judgments arise from these two points of reference in dealing with what is tama (right-choices, decisions and actions) and mali (wrong choice, decision and action because they are not in accordance with the halaga-standards) (Jocano 25). Many OFWs in this study expressed that learning the culture, behavior, language and following rules and regulations in the Middle Eastern culture is what is tama and important to live effectively in the OFW ethnoscape. Giving *halaga* to their work as the source of family financial support and their consideration that para sa pamilya ko ito, not only transforms their attitudes towards work into "passions of excellence," as what Respondent 6 from KSA said, "Pinrove ko sa kanila na magaling ang mga Pilipino" but also elevates to a higher level their pagkatao or sense of self-worth. Jocano claims that higher sense of selfesteem brings Filipinos closer to other people because it makes them aware that the other is also tao (human.). It guides them to further handle relationships in terms of pakikipagkapwa-tao (cultivating harmonious relations with others). The cultural value of pakikipagkapwa-tao also explains how friends are buttresses in OFW life (42).

Respondents give more *halaga* (worth, relevance or significance) to their families back home and their desire to provide for them than the 'differences' in this 'other' culture. The sense of giving *halaga* to their personal goals, determine

their *asal* (manifest behavior-"ought" and the "ought not in Filipino culture). They try to maintain good traits or acts of good as this is *mabuting asal* (Jocano, 27).

Filipino religiosity or spirituality has also been exemplified by the respondents. In the Filipino traditional culture, diwa is the spiritual core of the traditional values. The respondents expressed panalangin sa Diyos, pananampalataya or faith in God and religion as anchors in their OFW life. The spiritual essence of diwa is expressed in faith or pananampalataya in God and katapatan (sincerity, loyalty) to fellow humans. Pananampalataya is the Filipino value orientation that explains the shared knowledge about the role of supernatural resources on the Filipino life. Diwa can be understood as the "supernatural power in us." We become strong or weak depending on how deep our pananampalataya is as we are part of the universal design of nature (Jocano 27). Alejo affirms this local knowledge by his concept of cultural energy. He posits that the Filipino's popular spirituality brings about cultural energy, the people's collective capability or desire to be themselves. In a lecture he delivered at the Spirituality Forum III, Alejo quotes from his earlier book, Popular Spirituality as Cultural Energy (11)

how those who suffer sometimes generate energy not just for themselves but also for those who helped them. Scholars observed that at times unexpected creativity arises when subjugated people are set to have been crushed, new forms of knowledge are released, even new dances and songs come out, making new relations and definition of the world w/c are at least manageable if not normally feasible. History is re-interpreted funning the spurt of hope in the past. This serves as strength, knowledge and imagination of cultural energy.

Cultural energy seems to be what people need to collectively endure pain as well as to begin a protest or given to just sustain their existence. In this partly of what is shared where people sympathizers are around and partly what they generate from their own moral and cultural resources when the external allies have moved away.

The OFW experience illustrates such cultural energy that is generated from their own *moral and cultural resources*. It is what creates *new dances and songs* in the midst of challenges and differences in the conflicted OFW ethnoscape. Alejo writes that cultural energy can be associated with power, but

"it is more the power to will, rather than the will to power. The will to power is associated either with domination power over somebody or resistance power against somebody. The power to will is more on moral and spiritual on creative resource to be or to remain or at least become a people of self-confidence and self-affirmation. This is what ordinary people are ultimately trying to keep alive in the struggle against hopelessness (11)."

In the conflicted OFW ethnoscape, a new identity empowered by the cultural energy "keeps them alive in the struggle of hopelessness." When the respondents indicated seemingly resigned responses such as "wala lang maghintay lang," or "I kept quiet," or "accept the fact," or "I just let it pass," or "wala naman hindi ko lang pinapansin kung malala naman pasensya na lang," it is not, as it may seem, a phenomenon or a new identity of a "willing slave." The OFW ethnoscape exemplifies 'contemporary global flows' (Hannigan 286) where OFWs re-invent their lives by adjusting to the "other" local culture and meanings, even as they continue to embrace local tradition. It is the strength of their cultural energy that gives

them meaning and provides the framework for their action. It is the way to go beyond being labeled as "weak" or "maids or servant," or "slave" or "pang bahay lang," rather they have their agenda in life. It is an expression of being human. It is neither domination nor resistance. It is the energy to be themselves (Alejo 10). Alejo states,

The people of popular spirituality are a people with mixed motivation, with the struggle to find the way to go on with life, given the situation, given the powers, given the hierarchy (11).

Cultural energy is the essence of the spiritual *diwa* of the Filipino. One of the expressions of cultural energy is the OFW resiliency. Strobel affirms the essence of cultural energy exemplified in the Filipino resiliency, the will to survive, ability to sing and make merry, comes from indigeneity. Strobel calls it indigenous consciousness expressed in *diwa* (psyche), *kapwa* (the shared inner self) and *loob* (the core of being) that give shape to the Filipino character, values and traditions. Therefore, in the over-all perspective of the OFWs in this study to accept and understand the "other" culture even as they embrace their own identity and tradition, even when considered as the "other," is an expression of that cultural energy.

The concept of "otherness" can be seen in opposite ways through the concept of "ethnoscape gaze". The concept of the "ethnoscape gaze" leads the deterritorialised OFW actor to the perspective that every adventure, every relationship in every inter-cultural encounter in the conflicted ethnoscape between the OFWs and the other represents an "embodiment of difference". (Urry and Rojek; cited in Mackie 1). His local identity and self-concept are challenged in the OFW ethnoscape, a new inter-cultural space. Therefore, without necessarily setting it aside,

he wears the "ethoscape gaze" in the construction of a new identity where the OFW persona may adapt and live effectively, shaped by Filipino values, empowered by his cultural energy, by accepting realities of the new *pila* system, and the challenges in the social and workplace structures.

On the other hand, the Arabs seem to take on a reverse negative reflection of this ethnoscape gaze, a kind of perspective that Mackie explicates, involves a "binary division between the ordinary or everyday and the extraordinary" (1). The culture of these Middle-Eastern countries is so restrictive so much so that some Arabs may feel "free" to make abuses to non-Muslims or foreigners such as the OFWs. They probably feel that it is 'safe' as it involves "not one of their own" but a foreigner who is 'held captive' by their Arab employers or by the need of remittances and financial support. The Arabs' perception and treatment of the OFWs takes on that particular 'gaze' that implicates the 'difference.'The meanings attached to these negative encounters are importantly shaped not only by the given restrictive culture but by the "ethnoscape gaze," in this case, worn by the Arab hosts, by the real and imagined worlds within which there is a false sense of "freedom."

In Guzman's study cited earlier, the OFWs in Saudi Arabia expressed how their inter-cultural encounters have changed them. "Dito, mas nagiging responsible ka. At Lumalawak ang iyong kaisipan. Patibayan lang ng loob" (33). The deterritorialised OFWs accepted the realities in their inter-cultural encounter because "hindi habang panahon narito kami" (26). They have shown the importance of local value systems as an armature of response to their experience of discrimination, the social and emotional vagaries brought about by the exigencies of being deterritorialised. More OFWs accommodate rather than resist in the challenges they face in foreign cultures. The possibility

of adaptation and the willingness to re-invent deterritorialised lives are borne out of a holistic sense of self that enables them to live within inter-cultural encounters in its totality. It is derived from their cultural energy, an interior dimension of harmony (loob). Borrowing Strobel's words, it is a way of "suturing the split self" (127). The OFWs have carved a unique ethnoscape gaze where they retain their cultural identity, adapt to the new situation, and stay open to global processes.

Given that every inter-cultural encounter orients the deterritorialised OFW actors and reproduces itself, we must acknowledge that the encounter itself shapes the OFW spirit or "heart." It cultivates and enhances character traits, habits of the heart, so that we become the kind of a person rather than that kind. These processes of reification are clearly projects of "romancing our culture" (Jocano 2) while appreciating seeing beyond "race" and seeing the commonalities of all human beings in our inter-cultural encounters. In the meantime, we hang onto the balancing act of hope that one day this light-atthe-end-of-the-tunnel statement comes to pass:

Our goal is to create jobs at home so that there will be no need to look for employment abroad.

> - President Benigno Aquino III (2010, as quoted by Setyawati, 2013, emphasis mine)

#### **Works Cited**

- Acosta, Imee C., and Alexander S. Acosta. In Pain and In Wail: A Phenomenology of the Abuse of the Filipino Domestic Workers, Qatar. WIEGO Secretariat, Harvard University, 2013. Academic Search Complete. Accessed 14 January 2021.
- Alejo, Albert, E., SJ. "Popular Spirituality as Cultural Energy."

  Lecture Series 3 on Spirituality. Spirituality Forum III,
  University of Sto. Tomas, 5 August 2003.
- Alejo, Albert E., SJ. Generating Energies in Mount Apo: Cultural Politics in a Contested Environment, Ateneo de Manila University Press, 2000.
- Appadurai, Arjun. *Modernity At Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Volume 1. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997. pp. 37-38.
- Appadurai, Arjun. "Disjuncture and difference in the Global Cultural Economy." *Theory, Culture, & Society*, vol. 7, issue 2-3, 1990, pp. 295-310.
- Asis, Maruja M.B. "The Philippines' Culture of Migration." Migration Information Source, www.migration policy. org/article/Philippines-culture-migration, Accessed:14 January 2021.
- Bello Report. Final Report of the Investigating Mission of the Committee on Overseas Workers' Affairs (COWA) to Saudi Arabia, January 9 13, 2011. COWA, 2011. PDF file.
- Blank, Nathan. "Making Migration Policy: Reflections on the Philippines' Bilateral labor Agreements." *Asian Politics & Policy*, vol. 3, no. 2, 2011, pp. 185-205.

- De Guzman, Arnel F. "Katas ng Saudi": The Work and Life Situation of the Filipino contract workers in Saudi Arabia." *Philippine Social Science Review*, vol. 51 no. 1-4, January-December,1993. pp. 1-56.
- Gee, Gilbert C. "Social Support as a Buffer for Perceived Unfair Treatment Among Filipino Americans: Differences Between San Francisco and Honolulu." *American Journal* of *Public Health*, vol. 96, no.4, 2006, pp. 677-684.
- Giddens, Anthony. *The Consequences of Modernity*. Cambridge: Polity Press,1990.
- Hannigan, John. "Culture, Globalization, and Social Cohesion: Towards a De-territorialized, Global Fluids Model." Canadian Journal of Communication, vol. 27, no.2, 2002, pp. 277-287.
- Hernandez, Gil-Manuel I Marti. "The Deterritorialization of Cultural Heritage in a Globalized Modernity." Transfer: Journal of Contemporary Culture, no. 1, 2006. Pp. 92-107.
- Hosoda, Naomi. "Preventing Abuses against Filipino Migrant Domestic Workers." *East Asia Forum*, 2020. https://www.eastasiaforum.org/2020/04/02/preventing-abuses-against filipino-migrant-domestic-workers/. Accessed 14 January 2021
- Jocano, F. Landa. Filipino Social Organization: Traditional Kinship and Family Organization. Manila: Punlad Research House, 1998.
- Jocano, F. Landa. Filipino Value System: A Cultural Definition. Manila: Punlad Research House,1997.

- Jocano, Felipe P. Jr. Romancing the Culture: F. Landa Jocano and the Search for Identity. Otley Beyer Museum Talks, Anthropology Museum, 30 January 2014.
- Lane, Barbara. "Filipino Domestic Workers in Hongkong." *Asian Migrant*, vol. 5, no. 1, 1993, pp. 24-32.
- Pernia, Ernesto M. "Is Labor Export Good Development Policy?" *The Philippine Review of Economics*, vol. XIVIII, no. 1, June 2011, pp. 13-34.
- Mackie, Vera. "The Metropolitan Gaze: Travellers Bodies and Spaces." *Intersections: Gender, History and Culture in the Asian Context*, issue 4, September 2000. Accessed
- Ragma, Feljone Galima, and John Patrick Molina. "Angst of Warriors: The Fears of Overseas Workers (OFWs)." April 2018, *ResearchGate*, doi: 10.13140/RG.2.2.24373.17126. Accessed 14 January 2021.
- Setyawati, Dinita. "Assets or Commodities? Comparing Regulations of Placement and protection of Migrant workers in Indonesia and the Philippines." ASEAS-Austrian Journal of South-East Asian Studies, vol.6, no.2, 2013, pp. 264-280, www.ssoar.info/ssoar/bitstream/handle/document/40153/ssoar-aseas-2013-2-setyawati-Assets\_or\_commodities\_Comparing\_regulations. pdf?sequence=1. Accessed 14 Jan 2021.
- Soco, Andrea. "Relationalities of Identity: Sameness and Difference Among Filipino Migrant Domestic Workers." *Philippine Sociological Review*, vol. 59, 2011, pp. 67-86.

- Strobel, Leny Mendoza. "A Personal Story: On Becoming a Split Filipina Subject." *Pinay Power: Feminist Critical Theory: Theorizing the Filipina/American Experience*, edited by Melinda L. De Jesus, Routledge, 2005, pp. 117-130.
- Urry, John, and Jonas Larsen. *The Tourist Gaze*. Sage Publications Ltd, 2011.
- Urry, John. *The Tourist Gaze: Leisure Travel in Contemporary Societies*. Sage Publications, Ltd., 1994.
- Yang, Dean. "How Remittances Help Migrant Families." Migration Information Source, www.migrationpolicy.org/ article/how-remittances-help-migrnt-families. Accessed 20 Jan 2019.
- Vanhoozer, Kevin J., et al., editors. Everyday Theology: How to Read Cultural Texts and Interpret Trends, Baker Academic, 2007.
- "Racial Discrimination." *FindLaw*, <a href="https://civilrights.findlaw.com/discrimination/racial-discrimination.html">https://civilrights.findlaw.com/discrimination/racial-discrimination.html</a>. Accessed 20 Jan 2019.
- Jarvis, Frank. "Reasonable Steps to Preventing Workplace Harassment." Equality and Human Right Commission, 16 March 2021, https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/our-work/blogs/reasonable-steps-preventing-workplace-harassment. Accessed 10 April 2021.
- "OFW Rescued from Abusive Employers in Saudi." *ABS-CBN News*,2019,https://news.abs-cbn.com/overseas/04/30/19/ofw-rescued-from-abusive-employers-in-saudi. Accessed 10 February 2021.